

From Participation
to Deliberation
A Critical Genealogy
of Deliberative Democracy

Antonio Florida



© Antonio Florida 2017

First published by the ECPR Press in 2017

Translated by Sarah De Sanctis from the Italian edition, *Un'idea deliberativa della democrazia*, published by La Società editrice il Mulino

The translation of this work has been funded by SEPS
Segretariato Europeo Per Le Pubblicazioni Scientifiche



Via Val d'Aposa 7 – 40123 Bologna – Italy
seps@seps.it – www.seps.it

The ECPR Press is the publishing imprint of the European Consortium for Political Research (ECPR), a scholarly association, which supports and encourages the training, research and cross-national co-operation of political scientists in institutions throughout Europe and beyond.

ECPR Press
Harbour House
Hythe Quay
Colchester
CO2 8JF
United Kingdom

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Typeset by Lapiz Digital Services

Printed and bound by Lightning Source

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

HARDBACK ISBN: 978-1-785522-42-0

PAPERBACK ISBN: 978-1-785522-75-8

PDF ISBN: 978-1-785522-76-5

EPUB ISBN: 978-1-785522-77-2

KINDLE ISBN: 978-1-785522-78-9

www.ecpr.eu/ecppress

Table of Contents

List of Figures	xiii
Acknowledgements	xv
Introduction	1
PART I – THE RISE AND FALL OF PARTICIPATORY DEMOCRACY IN THE 1960s AND 1970s	13
Chapter One – Participatory Democracy in the 1960s and 1970s: The Origins of a Model	15
1.1 The background and the scene: participatory democracy in political and theoretical debates in the United States in the 1960s	15
1.2 The critique of elitist theories of democracy and the meaning of the pluralist approach	23
1.3 Participatory democracy as a new form of democracy: Pateman and Macpherson	32
1.4 Levels and forms of participation: Sherry R. Arnstein’s ‘ladder’	38
Chapter Two – Beyond Participatory Democracy: The Debate in the 1980s	43
2.1 Benjamin Barber: searching for a ‘strong democracy’	43
2.2 Jane Mansbridge: ‘unitary democracy’ and ‘adversary democracy’	50
2.3 Beyond participatory democracy: two different paths	58
PART II – THE BUILDING PROCESS OF THE THEORETICAL FIELD OF DELIBERATIVE DEMOCRACY	61
Chapter Three – At the Origins of ‘Deliberative Democracy’: Interpretations of the American Constitution	63
3.1 Joseph M. Bessette: the American Constitution as a blueprint of deliberative democracy	63
3.2 Cass R. Sunstein: deliberative democracy and republicanism	70
Chapter Four – Jon Elster: ‘Non-Orthodox’ Versions of Rationality and Models of Political Theory	79
4.1 The forum and the market	79
4.2 The ‘ideal speech situation’: a pragmatic presupposition of communicative action or a political ideal?	83
4.3 The nature of politics and the aim of participation	93

Chapter Five – Bernard Manin: Public Deliberation and Democratic Legitimacy	97
5.1 Rousseau, the ‘general will’ and the deliberation ‘of all’	97
5.2 Debating with Rawls: deliberation, the original position and ‘rational choice’	101
5.3 The ‘deliberation of all’ as a source of democratic legitimacy	106
5.4 Debating with Habermas: the public sphere, ‘consensus of all’ and democratic deliberation	111
Chapter Six – Joshua Cohen: An ‘Ideal Deliberative Procedure’	121
6.1 ‘Deliberative democracy’ as an ideal	121
6.2 The democratic ideal of a ‘deliberative association’	127
6.3 From the ideal deliberative procedure to institutions	131
Chapter Seven – Intersections, Convergences and New Developments: Expanding the Theoretical Field of Deliberative Democracy	139
7.1 John Forester: communicative interaction, policy analysis and planning practices	139
7.2 John S. Dryzek’s ‘discursive democracy’	146
7.3 James Fishkin: deliberative democracy and political theory	150
7.3.1 <i>Fishkin and Dahl: minipopulus and ‘enlightened understanding’</i>	151
7.3.2 <i>Fishkin, Ackerman and the ‘dualist conception’ of democratic politics</i>	162
Chapter Eight – The ‘Constitutive Phase’ of Deliberative Democracy: An Assessment	171
8.1 The five ‘critical frontiers’ of deliberative democracy	171
8.2 ‘Participatory’ and ‘deliberative’: continuity, contiguity or break?	175
PART III – HABERMAS AND RAWLS: THE THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS OF DELIBERATIVE DEMOCRACY	183
Chapter Nine – Habermas and ‘Deliberative Politics’	185
9.1 <i>Between Facts and Norms</i> : a ‘defection’ from the field of deliberative democracy?	185
9.2 A procedural conception of democracy and the tension between ‘facticity’ and ‘validity’	188
9.3 Models and concepts of ‘deliberative politics’: constitutional legitimacy and republicanism	190
9.4 Deliberative politics: ethical self-understanding or an ordinary trait of a democracy?	198
9.5 Deliberative politics: pragmatic discourses, ethical discourses and moral discourses	202
9.6 Habermas and the ‘democratic question’: against ‘normative defeatism’	213

Chapter Ten – Deliberative Politics: the State, the Public Sphere and Civil Society	221
10.1 Habermas, the ‘two-track model’ and ‘sluices’	221
10.2 Habermas <i>versus</i> Cohen: can deliberative politics ‘shape’ the whole of society?	227
10.3 Cohen and Sabel’s ‘democratic experimentalism’: a model of deliberative governance	233
10.4 Cohen <i>versus</i> Habermas: The ‘public sphere’ – informal or structured?	240
Chapter Eleven – Rawls: The Idea of ‘Public Reason’ and Deliberative Democracy	247
11.1 Introduction	247
11.2 The idea of public reason	249
11.3 Public reason and the dilemmas of ‘reasonable pluralism’	254
11.4 Public reason as a deliberative paradigm	259
11.5 Public reason and deliberative democracy	267
11.6 The Rawlsian approach to deliberative democracy	275
Chapter Twelve – The Dialogue between Habermas and Rawls: Just a ‘Family Quarrel’?	279
12.1 Introduction	279
12.2 ‘Original position’ and ‘ideal speech situation’	281
12.3 ‘Reasonableness’ and ‘consensus’; ‘justification’ and ‘legitimation’: the forms and ways of deliberative practice	284
12.3.1 <i>Habermas versus Rawls</i>	284
12.3.2 <i>Rawls versus Habermas</i>	287
12.3.3 <i>Implications for deliberative democracy</i>	292
12.4 Philosophers and citizens	297
PART IV – THE THEORETICAL FIELD OF DELIBERATIVE DEMOCRACY TODAY	303
Chapter Thirteen – The Deliberative Field: A Possible ‘Map’	305
13.1 Introduction	305
13.2 A ‘working theory’	307
13.3 The legacy of Habermas and Rawls ... but not only	308
13.4 An ideal model or a theoretical model of democracy?	312
13.5 An ‘empirical’ or a ‘policy-oriented’ turn?	315
13.6 The ‘systemic approach’ to deliberative democracy	322
13.6.1 <i>A ‘deliberative system’: definition and functions</i>	322
13.6.2 <i>Deliberation, participation and the forms of democratic politics</i>	328
13.6.3 <i>The link between participation, deliberation and conflict</i>	330

13.6.4 <i>What makes a decision ‘good’ or ‘correct’? The epistemic functions of deliberation</i>	332
Conclusion: In Praise of Mediation	337
Bibliography	351
Index	383
Index of Names	393

List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Arnstein's 'ladder' of citizen participation	39
Figure 7.1: Fishkin's three democratic dimensions scheme	155
Figure 9.1: Habermas: a process model of rational political will-formation	212